GCSE MARKING SCHEME

SUMMER 2017

HISTORY - STUDY IN-DEPTH
WALES AND ENGLAND IN THE EARLY TWENTIETH CENTURY, c.1890-1919
4271/02
INTRODUCTION

This marking scheme was used by WJEC for the 2017 examination. It was finalised after detailed discussion at examiners’ conferences by all the examiners involved in the assessment. The conference was held shortly after the paper was taken so that reference could be made to the full range of candidates’ responses, with photocopied scripts forming the basis of discussion. The aim of the conference was to ensure that the marking scheme was interpreted and applied in the same way by all examiners.

It is hoped that this information will be of assistance to centres but it is recognised at the same time that, without the benefit of participation in the examiners' conference, teachers may have different views on certain matters of detail or interpretation.

WJEC regrets that it cannot enter into any discussion or correspondence about this marking scheme.

NOTE ON THE QUALITY OF WRITTEN COMMUNICATION

Examiners are required to credit the quality of written communication for each candidate's performance on particular questions. These are question 2(c) and question 3. There are no additional marks for the Quality of Written Communication, but examiners are expected to consider the following descriptions of performance when awarding levels to the work of candidates:

| Level 1 | the text is generally legible; aspects of spelling, punctuation and grammar are clear; some information is presented in a suitable manner |
| Level 2 | most of the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are used to make the meaning clear; information is presented in a suitable format |
| Level 3 | the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are sufficiently accurate to make meaning clear; relevant information is presented in a suitable format; uses an appropriate structure and style of writing; uses some specialist vocabulary |
| Level 4 | the text is legible; spelling, punctuation and grammar are consistently accurate to make meaning clear; information is always presented in a suitable format; uses an appropriate structure and style of writing; uses specialist vocabulary accurately |
Question 1 (a)

Target: Understanding of source material

Mark allocation: 4

AO1  AO2  AO3  4

Question: What do Sources A and B suggest about popular entertainment in the early twentieth century? [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer, paraphrasing or describing sources only. [1-2]

*Eg: Source A tells us that the cinema was becoming more popular and movie stars, like Charlie Chaplin, were becoming famous.*

LEVEL 2 Uses the content of both sources in their historical context. [3-4]

If answer is imbalanced in use of sources award 3 marks.

*Eg: Source A shows that new cinemas were built, such as the Carlton Cinema in Swansea in 1914. Music halls were also popular as they showed theatre plays. Movie stars such as Charlie Chaplin were becoming famous. Source B shows that rugby was popular with a crowd of 45,000 watching the Welsh rugby team defeat New Zealand in 1905.*
Question 1 (b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target:</th>
<th>Understanding of source material; recall and deployment of own knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mark allocation:</td>
<td>AO1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question: Use Source C and your own knowledge to explain why there was so much poverty at the beginning of the twentieth century.  [6]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; copies or paraphrases source material; uses content of source only. [1-2]

*Eg: The source shows that having large families led to poverty.*

LEVEL 2 Understands content of the source with some background knowledge. [3-4]

*Eg: The source shows that having large families caused poverty at the beginning of the twentieth century. Couples with young children in particular suffered as they would not be able to contribute to the financial needs of the family. There was also high unemployment, making it difficult for families to cope. In households where the breadwinner became injured or too ill to work considerable poverty was suffered, and often meant that families would have to go to the workhouse.*

LEVEL 3 Clear use of the content of the source with accurate and detailed background knowledge used to explain the issue. [5-6]

*Eg: As above with references to other causes of poverty, such as old age, low wages, death of a breadwinner, drinking, gambling etc.*
Question 1 (c)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target: Understand, analyse and evaluate source material: recall and deployment of own knowledge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mark allocation: AO1 AO2 AO3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question: How useful are Sources D and E to an historian studying attitudes towards the Liberal government’s social reforms? [8]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Comprehends content of the sources; little focus on utility. [1-2]

Eg: Source D tells us that the Liberal government wanted to deal with the problems facing the poor. They had already introduced the pension, but this was just the start.

LEVEL 2 Considers usefulness of the sources in terms of their content and/or authorship. [3-4]

Eg: Source D is useful as it tells us that the Liberal government was determined to eliminate the problems faced by the needy in society, and that it would not stop with just the old age pension. The source is a speech by David Lloyd George, the Liberal Chancellor, in 1909, just after the introduction of old age pensions. Source E is useful because it tells us that some people were against the social reforms and felt that they were an excuse to raise the taxes paid by the rich.

LEVEL 3 Evaluates both sources in context with some imbalance; reaches conclusion regarding utility for the set enquiry. [5-6]

Eg: As above. The author of Source D was David Lloyd George, the Liberal Chancellor, in a speech in front of the Liberal Party in 1909. He realises that even though old age pensions have been introduced, there is still much work to be done to solve the problems of poverty. Source E tells us that Liberal reforms were not needed and are just an excuse to raise taxes paid by the rich. But as this has been said by the Duke of Marlborough, a Conservative politician and someone who would be directly affected by Lloyd George’s tax rises, he is bound to have a negative attitude towards them. As his party is in opposition, he would obviously find fault with any Liberal policy, especially one that would cost him money.
LEVEL 4  Evaluates both sources regarding the specific historical context; reaches reasoned and substantiated judgement regarding their utility for the set enquiry.

Eg: As above. Both sources are very useful in finding out about attitudes towards the Liberal reforms. The purpose of source D is to show that while old age pensions have already been introduced, there is still work to be done, and further social reforms needed to help the needy. Candidates may refer to the fact that David Lloyd George’s attitudes towards Liberal reforms are not completely genuine, and that he is aware that if the Liberal government does not try to deal with the problems of poverty they will lose votes to the Labour Party. Source E has a negative attitude towards the Liberal reforms. The author does not believe that the reforms are needed. As the Duke of Marlborough was a Conservative politician, he was unlikely to give his support to any Liberal policy. As most members of the House of Lords were Conservative politicians, and the richest people in society, they would have to carry the burden of paying for these extra taxes. As a Duke, he would find that his taxes would rise considerably, and for this reason, speaks against the reforms. He is speaking in 1909, when the Budget was introduced in order to raise money to pay for the reforms, and would no doubt be angry about the effect it would have on his own personal finances. At the time, he was unlikely to be interested in the major needs of the aged or the poor, as his own lifestyle would have been remarkably different. The author is obviously affected and his emotional attachment to what happened has clouded his judgement.
Question 2(a)

**Target:** Recall and deployment of knowledge

**Mark allocation:**
- AO1: 4
- AO2: 4
- AO3: 4

**Question:** Describe the Tonypandy Riots of 1910. [4]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

**LEVEL 1** Generalised answer with weak or implied points made. [1-2]

*Eg:* A riot took place and the police were brought in. Shop windows were smashed.

**LEVEL 2** A more detailed and accurate description. [3-4]

*Eg:* 80 miners at the Ely Colliery, owned by the Cambrian Coal Combine, were sacked in a dispute and others were locked out. Miners in other collieries stopped work in support, so that by November 30,000 miners were on strike. ‘Blackleg labour’ was brought in to break the strike. A protest meeting on 7 November ended with serious clashes between miners and the police. Tensions were high and around 60 shops were attacked and looted in Tonypandy. The Home Secretary, Winston Churchill, sent mounted troops and police to deal with the situation. Eventually hunger and misery forced the miners to return to work on 1 September 1911.
Question 2(b)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Target: Understand and analyse source material; recall and deployment of knowledge</th>
<th>AO1</th>
<th>AO2</th>
<th>AO3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Question: Why was Source F produced in 1912? [6]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

**LEVEL 1** Comprehends content of the source; little focus on why it was produced. [1-2]

*Eg: The source shows The Miners’ Next Step, which was produced to reform the SWMF.*

**LEVEL 2** Considers the source in its historical context; suggests some reasons for its production. [3-4]

*Eg: The source shows a pamphlet called the Miners’ Next Step, which was produced to try and change the SWMF and make it more radical. Attitudes were changing at this time due to events such as the Tonypandy Riot of 1910 and Eight Hours Act of 1908, and many miners felt that union leadership was too moderate. Syndicalists believed that workers and poor people should take action to improve their lives so this pamphlet was produced to highlight these ideas.*

**LEVEL 3** Analyses the source in its historical context; gives detailed reasons regarding its production at the time. [5-6]

*Eg: The Miners Next Step was published as younger members of the SWMF, such as Noah Ablett, believed that the union was too moderate. The authors of the pamphlet proposed to reconstruct their union as a revolutionary industrial organisation, directly controlled by the workers themselves, which through an uncompromising pursuit of the class struggle would become powerful enough to take over the collieries and oust the coal owners. Events such as the Tonypandy Riots of 1910 had enhanced the ideas that syndicalists held. They wanted to change the union by letting the workers themselves decide their working conditions and how the work should be done.*
Question 2(c)

Target: Recognition and explanation of historical interpretations; analysis of key historical features; quality of written communication

Mark allocation: AO1 2 AO2 2 AO3 6

Question: One interpretation is that Lord Penrhyn was to blame for the Penrhyn Lockout lasting so long. How far do you agree with this interpretation? [10]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1 Generalised answer; makes simple comments about the interpretation; will copy or paraphrase the given evidence.

Eg: Evidence 1 states that Lord Penrhyn was to blame. Evidence 2 argues that the striking quarrymen were to blame.

LEVEL 2 Identifies differences between ways in which the issue has been interpreted; will offer a basic judgement with some support from given evidence and/or own knowledge of the issue.

Eg: Answers will show understanding of the named interpretation that Lord Penrhyn was to blame for the Penrhyn Lockout lasting so long. He was stubborn and refused to negotiate wages or working conditions. He would not budge.

Expect basic contextual support to be given in terms of a judgement. The source was written by Geraint H. Jenkins, an historian. He would have carried out considerable research into the subject and would have a balanced view of the situation. Evidence 2 argues that striking quarrymen were to blame, as they were determined not to return to work. Use of the given evidence will be more apparent than use of own knowledge.

LEVEL 3 Begins to recognise and comment on how and why this issue has been interpreted in different ways; will give a judgement regarding the given interpretation.

Eg: Answers will address the question by offering comment on different interpretations of the different interpretations.

Answers will begin to demonstrate why different interpretations of this issue have been made. Expect detailed discussion of the first interpretation. He is an historian, writing in a general history book, and whilst he would have carried out considerable research into the issue, he has not looked at it in enough detail to give a full interpretation. The Penrhyn Lockout would have been a small section within a general book about Wales. However, as his book is about Wales, he may be biased against the English Lord Penrhyn, and want to paint a good picture of the Welsh workers. Evidence 2 is the interpretation of R. Mertyn Jones, who believes that the striking quarrymen were to blame for prolonging the lockout. As he is a specialist on North Wales quarrying, his interpretation will be more valid. He will have looked at the whole picture and have a much clearer view of the causes of the lockout lasting for so long.

Answers will be supported by a greater degree of contextual knowledge regarding this issue.

Evidence 3 may be seen to support the interpretation made in Evidence 2. It shows a photograph of a sign put in the window of homes of people who continued striking between 1900-1903. The phrase says, ‘There are no traitors in this house.’ It supports the view that striking quarrymen were determined not to return to work at the quarry.
LEVEL 4 Recognises and provides substantiated comments on how and why this issue has been interpreted in different ways; will give a clear judgement considering the given interpretation in the historical context. [9-10]

Eg: Answers will clearly state whether they agree with the given interpretation. In order to make this judgement, answers will discuss how the given interpretation has been arrived at and recognise that there are other valid interpretations of this issue. Answers will demonstrate why it is possible to make different interpretations of this issue. There will be a considerable degree of historical support in the answer using both the given evidence and own knowledge.

Answers will test the value of the chosen interpretation by commenting on issues such as the fact that both historians are writing from a more reasoned and distant perspective. Geraint H. Jenkins will have carried out extensive research and has reached a balanced view, but his book is a generalised book on Wales, therefore, he would not have looked very deeply into the issue of the Penrhyn Lockout. It would simply form a brief part of his book, which was published in 1990. As a Welshman he may want to give his support to the Welsh workers against the English owner of the quarry, Lord Penrhyn.

Answers may comment on the differences in interpretation given. R. Merfyn Jones was writing in 1982. As he is a specialist in North Wales quarrying, he would have a much greater understanding of the Penrhyn Lockout. He has written a book specifically about the men involved in the dispute. His book, The North Wales Quarrymen 1874-1922, is a detailed book, as it only covers approximately 40 years of history, therefore, his interpretation would have to be more valid.

Evidence 3 can be seen to support the view of source 2. By placing this sign in their windows, the striking quarrymen were making it clear that they had no intention of returning to work, and would see anyone who did as a traitor to their cause.
Question 3

Question:

Was the First World War a mostly negative experience for the people of Wales and England? [12+3]

Use 0 for incorrect or irrelevant answers.

LEVEL 1

Generalised answer; basic response which offers little support. [1-3]

Eg: Yes/No – loved ones were killed, women lives improved as there were more jobs available to them.

LEVEL 2

Answer begins to discuss the issue set in the question. [4-6]

To distinguish between 4 and 6 marks apply the following:

For 4 marks: A one-sided answer with some contextual support OR a very weak two-sided answer with little contextual support.

For 5-6 marks: A developed one-sided answer with contextual support OR a weak two-sided answer with some contextual support. Award the higher mark for the degree of contextual support.

Eg: Life in wartime Wales and England was tough. Expect references to the fact that many lives were lost and families were broken up. Life on the Western Front proved to be tremendously challenging and there was a high death rate. People suffered from shortages at the end of the war. However, many women were given new job opportunities previously unavailable to them in munition factories and in the Land Army.

LEVEL 3

Answer is mainly a reasoned analysis of the issue set in the question. [7-9]

To distinguish between 7 and 9 marks apply the following:

For 7 marks: A very good one-sided answer with contextual support OR an unbalanced two-sided response with contextual support.

For 8-9 marks: A reasoned and developed analysis of the issue but lacking some detail or balance. Award the higher mark for the degree of contextual support.

Eg: Answers will give examples of mostly negative effects but will begin to look at the positive effects. Expect reference to people’s views of war changed as the fighting dragged on, when conscription was introduced from 1916, and when families lost more and more loved ones. Loss of life and the shortages caused by war led to considerable suffering. Many people’s disillusionment with the long-lasting war was reflected in the words of the ‘war poets’. The war did have a positive effect on the lives of people in Wales and England. Women played a vital role in the war, working in war factories and in the Land Army, producing food for the population. They gained a new sense of independence and those over 30 were rewarded with the vote. New advances were made in medicine and technology as a result of the war.
LEVEL 4 Answer is a developed, reasoned and well-substantiated analysis of the issue set in the question. [10-12]

To distinguish between 10 and 12 marks apply the following:
For 10 marks: A developed, reasoned and well-substantiated analysis with good balance, using mostly accurate and relevant contextual support.
For 11-12 marks: A developed, reasoned and well-substantiated analysis with good balance, using fully accurate and relevant contextual support. Award the higher mark for the degree of contextual support.

Eg: Answers will clearly evaluate the issue in the question. Answers will discuss many aspects of life on the home front during the First World War with a balanced look at the negative and positive effects. The war caused great hardship to the lives of people in Wales and England. There was increasing disillusionment with the war. The loss of life and the shortages caused by war led to considerable suffering. Conscription had to be introduced from 1916 because there were insufficient volunteers. This was unpopular. Conscientious objectors were treated as criminals. Although women had benefited from the increased opportunities during the war, many tended to revert back to their traditional duties in the home when the war was over.

The war did have a positive effect on the lives of people in Wales and England. People pulled together during the war as never before. Women played a vital role in the war, working in war factories and in the Land Army, producing food for the population. They gained a new sense of independence and those over 30 were rewarded with the vote. New advances were made in medicine and technology as a result of the war. DORA generally kept up the morale of the people and rationing ensured that people did not suffer too greatly. Government changes improved the lot of the farmers and agricultural labourers.

Examiners are expected to award marks for spelling, punctuation and the accurate use of grammar in this question.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Performance descriptions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>0</td>
<td>Candidates do not reach the threshold performance outlined in the performance description below.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Threshold performance</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 mark</td>
<td>Candidates spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with reasonable accuracy in the context of the demands of the question. Any errors do not hinder meaning in the response. Where required, they use a limited range of specialist terms appropriately.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Intermediate performance</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 marks</td>
<td>Candidates spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with considerable accuracy and general control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a good range of specialist terms with facility.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>High performance</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 marks</td>
<td>Candidates spell, punctuate and use the rules of grammar with consistent accuracy and effective control of meaning in the context of the demands of the question. Where required, they use a wide range of specialist terms adeptly and with precision.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>